

Final Report

OFFICE OF TRADE AGREEMENT ADMINISTRATION AND TECHNICAL COOPERATION

Grantee: The Asia Foundation, Afghanistan					
Project title: Raising Public Awareness and Strengthening Ministry of Labor, Social Affairs, Martyrs, and the Disabled (MoLSAMD) to Better Protect the Rights of Workers in Afghanistan-Phase II					
Project number: Agreement No. IL-20810-10-75-K		Reporting Dates		Preparation date: March 31, 2012	
		From: September 30, 2010	To: December 31, 2011		
Project budget: <u>Source</u> <u>Amount</u> US Department of Labor US\$500,000	Start date: September 30, 2010 End date: December 31, 2011	Evaluation dates:			
			Planned as per Project Document / Monitoring and Evaluation Plan	Proposed new dates	Actual dates carried out
		Mid-term:	Mid-point of project		Not conducted
		Final:	Two months before end on Dec 31 2011		

<p>Grantee's HQ Contact official: (name, phone, fax and email) Nancy Yuan Vice President/Director, Washington D.C. Tel: 202-588-9420 Fax: 202-588-9409 Email: nyuan@asiafound-dc.org</p> <p>Grantee's Field Contact official: (name, phone, fax and email) V. Bruce J. Tolentino Country Representative, Kabul, Afghanistan Tel: +93 (0) 75 202 3558 Email: btolentino@asiafound.org</p>	<p>Person responsible for completing the report: (name, title, office address, phone, fax and email) Katherine S. Hunter Senior Deputy Country Director Kabul, Afghanistan Tel: +93 (0) 75 202 3558 Email: khunter@asiafound.org</p>
<p>OBJECTIVES:</p> <p>Development Objectives: To contribute to the protection and promotion of labor rights in Afghanistan by strengthening the ability of MoLSAMD to enforce the Afghan labor law and by increasing understanding and awareness of the core International Labor Standards among workers, employers, other government organizations, members of the judiciary, and civil society.</p> <p>Immediate Objective 1 Increased understanding and awareness of the new Afghan labor law and core International labor Standards within MoLSAMD and other ministries.</p> <p>Immediate Objective 2 Increased understanding and awareness of the new Afghan labor law and international core labor standards amongst workers, employers, their respective representatives, judges, members of the judiciary, and civil society.</p> <p>Immediate Objective 3 Increased sustainability of the project impact.</p>	

II. IMPLEMENTING ENVIRONMENT

Afghan citizens are guaranteed the right to work, fair treatment, equitable pay, provision of pensions, and health and safety in the work place. Afghanistan's laws establish the legal framework to protect workers from discrimination, and forced and child labor. Unfortunately, while there has been progress over the last year, the 2007 labor law and internationally-recognized core labor standards remain relatively unknown among Afghan citizens, the law and its regulations are not adequately implemented or enforced, and there is inadequate attention to establishment of incentives to enforce the law within the government in general. Responsible institutions, like the ministries and judiciary, lack trained personnel to carry out their responsibilities under the law. Likewise, due to limited knowledge of the existence of the Afghan Labor Law (and of laws in general), there is very limited citizen pressure for the law's enforcement.

The Asia Foundation (the Foundation), with the support of the US Department of Labor, is currently working with the Ministry of Labor, Social Affairs, Martyrs, and Disabled (MoLSAMD, or the Ministry). Under Phase I which was completed in 2010, the Foundation evaluated the 2007 labor law for compliance with International Labor Standards (ILS) and worked on strengthening MoLSAMD's ability to enforce it. The Foundation also worked to increase understanding and awareness of the 2007 Afghan Labor Law and ILS among other relevant Afghan partners in Balkh, Herat, and Kabul provinces. Phase I accomplished its objectives and, notably, MoLSAMD has received requests to expand the program.

The Foundation just finished implementing a 12-month, Phase II effort to further increase support for labor rights in Afghanistan. As with Phase I, the goal of Phase II is to strengthen the capacity of the MoLSAMD to enforce the 2007 Afghan Labor Law and increase understanding of the new labor law and international standards among the judiciary, workers, employers, and civil society. Moreover, Phase II will expand to two additional target provinces: Baghlan and Nangarhar.

Currently, the MoLSAMD is working with ILO on reform of the 2007 Afghan Labor Law. . The Director of Inspection Department and Acting General Director of Labor Law and working Condition Department of MoLSAMD stated that the ILO and MoLSAMD are continuing work on reforming the labor law, including taking initial steps to hire Afghan experts for work on specific aspects of the labor law. Due to the comprehensive nature of the reform process, it will be a lengthy one.

Depending on the nature and extent of the reforms, this will only increase the need for training of Ministry staff as well as reinforce the need for an analysis of the Ministry staffing structure and levels to effectively enforce the revised labor law. In March 2, 2012, the new resolution issued by the National Ulema Council places further constraints on women's ability to work due to specifications on male relatives accompanying them outside the home and on mixing of men and women in work, school, and other public venues. The impact of this new resolution, issued just before International Women's Day on March 8, 2012, on strengthening women's rights already articulated in the Afghan Labor Law as well as provided for in the Constitution, should be carefully monitored.

OVERALL PROGRESS OF THE PROJECT

II. A. Summary:

The Asia Foundation (the Foundation), through the support of the United States Department of Labor (USDOL) completed the project, *Raising Public Awareness and Strengthening Ministry of Labor, Social Affairs, Martyrs, and the Disabled (MoLSAMD) to Better Protect the Rights of Workers in Afghanistan-Phase II*. The Foundation succeeded in fulfilling its objectives and contributed to the protection and promotion of labor rights in Afghanistan by strengthening the ability of MoLSAMD to enforce the Afghan Labor Law and by increasing the understanding and awareness of the internationally recognized core International Labor Standards (ILS) among workers, employers, government organizations, judiciary, and civil society.

Compared to the start of Phase I in 2008, when most staff of MoLSAMD did not even have a copy of the Afghan Labor Law, the Ministry, its provincial departments, other government institutions, and civil society are more aware of the requirements in enforcing both the law and the ILS due to the variety of trainings, informational materials, and other activities in Phase II. Increased citizen awareness of their labor rights has led to an increase in the number of complaints and reports of violations. The larger challenge is being able to respond to the greater awareness and interest so that the momentum and interest is not lost at a time when development of the national economy is so crucial. It should be noted that the MoLSAMD considers this Labor Law Program to be the most successful in its history.

In working toward promoting and protecting the rights of workers in Afghanistan with the MoLSAMD over the 15-month project period, three potential new initiatives and interventions became evident. They include: increasing awareness of Afghan Labor Law to respond both to need and the high degree of interest expressed, with broader and deeper geographic coverage; emphasizing monitoring of the Afghan Labor Law; and expanding the sectors targeted. With the gains in the ability of MoLSAMD to enforce the law and the increased awareness of government officials, employers, and employees, while more extended efforts are needed in all of these areas, broader progress requires that Afghanistan should have a more adequate ability to respond to complaints in a timely and effective manner.

This project contributed to enhanced protection and promotion of labor rights in Afghanistan. The increased knowledge as well as the existence and greater availability of the first-ever training manual, 50,000 copies of popular public outreach materials designed for a predominately illiterate population, 31 master trainers from representative institutions (18 continuing from Phase I and 13 new trainers), and LLCGs are among the legacies of the USDOL project that will help to ensure greater progress in the future. The Foundation conceived of the LLCGs as a primary means of ensuring that leadership of the efforts to strengthen enforcement of the labor law became centered in MoLSAMD and other Afghan institutions, rather than the more typical practice in Afghanistan of having donors take the lead and thus failing to institutionalize the ownership of the processes. It was also a mechanism for the Ministry's consultation with other government agencies, civil society organizations, and others whose mandates relate to protecting and promoting labor rights, which occurs only rarely in Afghanistan to the detriment of more effective legal and policy enforcement.

II. B. Progress toward Strategic Goals and Operational Objectives and Indicators

Briefly describe the contribution of the project to the following Strategic Goals:

1. Objective I
<p><i>Increased understanding and awareness of the new Afghan labor law and core International Labor Standards within MoLSAMD and other ministries</i></p> <p>The project conducted two trainings, a meeting of stakeholder organizations to facilitate the development of the High Council at MoLSAMD, a workshop for administration and human resources department staff at MoLSAMD and other organizations, and printed brochures to support MoLSAMD's efforts to raise awareness of safe practices for migrant workers. The detailed activities included the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• A two-day training program for directors of MoLSAMD provincial offices on the Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Standards (27 provincial directors participated).• A five-day training program for the MoLSAMD provincial-level staff in the eastern region of Afghanistan on Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Standards in which 16 participants from the three provinces of Kunar, Laghman, and Nangarhar participated.• The meeting with stakeholder organizations was intended to facilitate the establishment of the High Council at MoLSAMD.• The workshop for the administration and human resources department staff at MoLSAMD and other relevant ministries regarding Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Standards provided broader exposure to responsible units of the ministries (26 staff participated).• On behalf of MoLSAMD, the Foundation printed 10,000 brochures to support the Ministry's effort to generate awareness of safe practices for migrant workers.
2. Objective II
<p><i>Increased understanding and awareness of the new Afghan labor law and international core labor standards amongst workers, employers, their respective representatives, judges, members of the judiciary, and civil society.</i></p> <p>The Foundation completed the following under this objective:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Distribution to 34 provinces of these publications: 5,000 copies of the Afghan Labor Law, 6,000 copies of the training manual developed by the Foundation, and 50,000 copies of Information, Education and Communication posters and brochures on the new Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Standards.• Development of four television clips on key topics in the Afghan Labor Law (dispute resolution, working hours, pension, and safety equipment) to be broadcast through television channels.• Organization of a five-day training program on the new Labor Law and International Labor Standards for key representatives of workers, employers,

<p>judiciary and civil society in the provinces of Baghlan, Baghlan, and Nangarhar (570 participants, 471 male and 99 female).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Conduct of trainings on Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Standards for the directors of administration and human resources departments of relevant civil society organizations and trade unions (30 participants, 22 male and 8 female). • Organization of a training program on the gender aspect of the Afghan Labor Law for 100 female workers in Balkh province.
<p>3. Objective III</p> <p><i>Increased sustainability of the project impact.</i></p> <p>In order to ensure sustainability, the Foundation facilitated 11 meetings of Labor Law Consultative Groups (LLCGs) in five provinces, organized a training on techniques of training for ten new master trainers to improve their capacity to deliver effective training, and helped to establish a MoLSAMD employment service center in Kabul through provision of brochures as well as equipment and furniture.</p> <p>The LLCG meetings for key governmental and non-governmental stakeholders included: five LLCG meetings in Kabul; two in Baghlan; one in Balkh; one in Bamiyan; and two in Nangarhar. The LLCG meetings provide a forum for discussion of labor law issues, as well as the trainings under this project and how to ensure sustainability and long-term impact of these efforts. The project also organized a three-day training program on techniques of training for 10 new master trainers in order to strengthen their capacity. Furthermore, the Foundation supported MoLSAMD in establishing an employment center by publishing brochures and providing IT equipment as well as furniture.</p>

III. PERFORMANCE INFORMATION AND ASSESSMENT

III. A. Measurement against project objectives

Objective I: Increased understanding and awareness of the new Afghan Labor Law and core International Labor Standards within MoLSAMD and other ministries.	
<p>Activity 1.1: <i>Conduct training program for 34 provincial directors of MoLSAMD on Afghan Labor Law and</i></p>	<p>In Kabul, between July 28 - 29, 2011, the Foundation conducted a two-day training program on the Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Standards for the directors of provincial-level MoLSAMD offices, known as Department of Labor, Social Affairs, Martyrs and Disabled (DoLSAMD) in cooperation with MoLSAMD.</p> <p>Directors from 27 provinces participated in the training program: Badakhshan, Badghis, Baghlan, Balkh, Bamiyan, Daykundi, Farah, Faryab, Ghor, Herat, Jowzjan, Kapisa, Khost, Kunar, Kunduz, Laghman, Logar, Nangarhar, Nuristan,</p>

<p><i>International Labor Standards in Kabul.</i></p>	<p>Paktika, Panjshir, Parwan, Samangan, Sar-e-Pol, Takhar, Wardak, and Zabul. While all 34 directors of DoLSAMDs were invited, seven were unable to attend due to personal reasons or security concerns.</p> <p>The master trainers, Mr. Bashir Ahmad Rasikh, director of MoLSAMD's Labor Inspection Department, and Ms. Wida Latif, the legal advisor of the Afghan Women Network (AWN), conducted the training. The two master trainers provided information about the rights of workers, and described the relevant provisions made by both Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Standards. The topics covered by the master trainers in the program included each of the chapters of Afghan Labor Law, as follows:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Code of Conduct; 2. Dispute Resolution; 3. Duration of the Working Week; 4. Entitlement to Rest and Leave; 5. Financial Responsibility of Employees; 6. General Legal Provisions; 7. Health and Safety Standards; 8. Other Labor Law Provisions and ILO Conventions. 9. Payment of Salaries and Wages; 10. Recruitment and Labor Contracts; 11. Skill Development of Employees; 12. Social Welfare and Security; 13. Vocational and Professional Training; and 14. Work of Women and Youth. <p>Before the closing of the two-day training program, the Foundation's labor team distributed evaluation forms to all participants to assess the impact of the training program. The evaluations reflected great interest and appreciation of the training. The most predominate theme in the evaluations was that the training should enable them to do their jobs more effectively as they have lacked awareness of the national and international legal framework of labor. The DoLSAMD directors also thanked USDOL and the Foundation for conducting the training. They requested similar training programs to be provided to their provincial staff and suggested additional workshops on leadership and management could also be facilitated.</p>
<p><i>Activity 1.2: Increase training programs for the MoLSAMD provincial staff in eastern region.</i></p>	<p>The Foundation conducted a five-day training program on Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Standards for MoLSAMD staff in the eastern region of Afghanistan, from June 26-30, 2011 in Nangarhar.</p> <p>Representatives of Kunar, Laghman, and Nangarhar DoLSAMDs participated in the training. A total of 16 provincial staff participated (four from Kunar, four from Laghman, and eight from Nangarhar). The Foundation invited provincial staff from Nooristan as well, but they were unable to attend due to security problems.</p> <p>Master trainers Mohammad Saber Halim and Mohammad Ashraf Samadi conducted the training for the senior-level DoLSAMD staff. The level of engagement of these participants was higher and deeper than experienced in comparison to other trainings of this kind. The trainees asked more questions and</p>

	<p>participated more actively in sharing their ideas and comments.</p> <p>The five-day training covered each of the nine topics of the training manual, as follows:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Afghan Labor Law; 2. Child Labor Law; 3. Collective Bargaining; 4. Contract Labor and Law; 5. International Labor Standards; 6. Prevention and Settlement of Labor Disputes 7. Reconciliation; 8. Social Dialogue; 9. Social Security for Labor; and 10. Women and Labor Law. <p><i>See Attachment I for copy of training manual.</i></p> <p>On the fifth and final day of the training, the Foundation organized a graduation ceremony. Mr. Abdul Hakim Shirzad, the director of DoLSAMD-Nangarhar thanked USDOL, the Foundation, and MoLSAMD for organizing such a beneficial training program. He also distributed certificates to training participants. The graduation ceremony was broadcast by the Nangarhar governmental television channel, Nangarhar Television.</p> <p>In the evaluation forms, the trainees expressed satisfaction with the program and many also requested additional training programs be organized in the future.</p>
<p>Activity 1.3: <i>Facilitate the establishment of MoLSAMD's High Council.</i></p>	<p>On November 11, 2011, the Foundation organized a meeting to establish the MoLSAMD High Council. Abdul Karim Hameed, the ex-director of the Labor Law Department and current advisor to the deputy minister of labor at MoLSAMD, chaired the meeting. In addition to government officials, representatives from trade unions, the National Union of Afghanistan Employees (NUEA), and Afghanistan Chamber of Commerce and Industries (ACCI) were also present in the meeting.</p> <p>In the meeting about the High Council, required by law but not yet implemented, Mr. Hameed stated, "Although establishing the High Council is a critical need of the country, unfortunately up to now none of the tripartite parties - the Labor, Employer, and Government - have paid enough attention to it." He gave examples of disputes between employers and employees at two locations: the Mis-E-Aynak Project, a copper mine project, and at the cement factory of Baghlan. He described how such a High Council could have mediated between the two parties to ease tensions.</p> <p>The meeting attendees discussed the duties and responsibilities of the members of the High Council, which include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Deciding who of the High Council member participates in ILO conferences;

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Deliberating long- term projects; • Determining the minimum wage; • Improving working conditions ; • Monitoring documents and legislation regarding labor; and • Developing schemes to address underemployment. <p>The group agreed to further discuss the issues within their respective offices so as to include the views and ideas of their colleagues. It was also decided that the attendees would develop a logo for the High Council for future use.</p> <p>Mr. Abdul Karim Hameed promised to take responsibility of developing the regulation for the High Council and for presenting it to the attending participants before the next meeting.</p> <p>After organizing this first meeting, the Foundation learned that the agreed-upon objective of establishing a High Council was now included in the recently concluded work plan of the cooperation between the ILO and the MoLSAMD Department of Labor Law. Due to the longer duration of the MoLSAMD-ILO agreement – three years rather than this project’s fifteen months – the Ministry chose to cooperate with the ILO rather than the Foundation on the further development of the High Council. As a result, the Foundation did not pursue further work in this area.</p>
<p><i>Activity 1.4: Conduct workshops for administration and HR department staff in MoLSAMD and other ministries.</i></p>	<p>The Foundation and the Ministry conducted a two-day training program on Afghan Labor Law for the senior staff of MoLSAMD as well as directors and senior administration and human resources personnel of other ministries in Kabul between April 12-13, 2011. The training included a total of 26 staff, from the following ministries:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • MoLSAMD; • Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock • Ministry of Culture and Information • Ministry of Economy • Ministry of Education • Ministry of Finance • Ministry of Foreign Affairs • Ministry of Hajj and Religious Affairs • Ministry of Mines and Industries; and • Ministry of Women’s Affairs. <p>The master trainers, MoLSAMD Labor Law Department Director Abdul Karim Hameed and MoLSAMD Advisor Ghulam Mustafa Harooni, conducted the training. They provided information on labor and related rights as they explained the provisions of Afghan Law Labor. Topics covered in the training:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dispute Resolution; • Ensuring Health and Occupational Safety Conditions; • Financial Responsibility of Employees;

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • General Provisions; • Payment of Salaries and Wages; • Recruitment and Labor Contract; • Rest and Leave Rights; • Skill Development of Employees; • Social Welfare and Security, and other provisions. • Standards and Rules of Work. • Time of Work; • Vocational and Professional Training; • Work of Women and Youth; and • Work Discipline. <p>The Foundation distributed evaluation forms to collect the views of participants regarding the impact of the training. In addition to the positive views on the training, they requested that future workshops should also explain relevant portion of the 42 regulations in addition to provisions of the Afghan Labor Law. In addition, they requested that Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Standards training be conducted for all governmental ministries and agencies.</p>
<p>Activity 1.5: Support MoLSAMD in creating awareness of safe practices for migrant workers.</p>	<p>In close consultation with MoLSAMD Acting Deputy Minister and Head of Overseas Employment Mr. Khair Mohammad Niru, the Foundation developed brochures for migrant workers. The brochures provided information about the rights of those who travel overseas as Afghan migrant workers via the MoLSAMD Department of Overseas Migration.</p> <p>As per the request of MoLSAMD, the Foundation printed 10,000 brochures and submitted them to the MoLSAMD Department of Overseas Migration for further distribution. The brochure's main points include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Government will assist migrant workers find employment opportunities overseas; • MoLSAMD is responsible for enforcing the implementation of Afghan Labor Law in the government and private sectors; • Agencies that work with migrant workers must: a) provide certification to demonstrate their legitimacy to assist migrant workers; b) orient workers on the customs, cultures, and laws of the overseas country; c) ensure the migrant workers' well-being and their return trip to Afghanistan; and d) guarantee that migrant workers are not exploited. <p>It should be noted that this is the Ministry's first effort to address the needs of migrant workers.</p> <p><i>See Attachment II for copy of the migrant worker brochure.</i></p>
<p>Objective 2: Increased understanding and awareness of the new Afghan labor law and international core labor standards amongst workers, employers, their respective</p>	

representatives, judges, members of the judiciary, and civil society.

Activity 2.1:
Distribute
Afghan Labor
Law,
International
Labor
Standards,
and training
materials as
well as the
Information,
Education and
Communicatio
n developed by
the
Foundation
on the new
labor law and
International
Labor
Standards.

The Foundation distributed 5,000 copies of the Afghan Labor Law, 6,000 copies of the training manual, and 50,000 copies of posters and brochures across the 34 provinces of Afghanistan. The chart below provides detail of the items sent to each province:

No.	Province	Labor Law	Training Manual	Posters	Brochures
1	Badakhshan	180	176	735	735
2	Badghis	100	176	735	735
3	Baghlan	100	176	735	735
4	Balkh	180	176	735	735
5	Bamiyan	100	176	735	735
6	Daykundi	100	176	735	735
7	Farah	100	176	735	735
8	Faryab	180	176	735	735
9	Ghazni	180	176	735	735
10	Ghor	100	176	735	735
11	Helmand	180	176	735	735
12	Herat	180	176	735	735
13	Jowzjan	180	176	735	735
14	Kabul	180	192	745	745
15	Kandahar	180	176	735	735
16	Kapisa	100	176	735	735
17	Khost	180	176	735	735
18	Kunar	180	176	735	735
19	Kunduz	180	176	735	735
20	Laghman	180	176	735	735
21	Logar	100	176	735	735
22	Nangarhar	180	176	735	735
23	Nimruz	100	176	735	735
24	Nuristan	100	176	735	735
25	Paktia	180	176	735	735
26	Paktika	100	176	735	735
27	Panjshir	100	176	735	735
28	Parwan	180	176	735	735
29	Samangan	180	176	735	735
30	Sar-e Pol	180	176	735	735
31	Takhar	180	176	735	735
32	Uruzgan	180	176	735	735
33	Wardak	100	176	735	735
34	Zabul	100	176	735	735
Total		5,000	6,000	25,000	25,000

The Foundation distributed the IEC materials to the DoLSAMD in each province. The feedback from the DoLSAMD directors in Balkh, Jowzjan, and Kapisa provinces highlight their usage of the materials, with any activities conducted at

	<p>their own expense:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Balkh: Distributed materials to shuras, and district and government offices; and hosted a one-day workshop with related offices and shuras using the material received. 2. Jowzjan: Director of DoLSAMD-Jowzjan had all departments in the province post copies of posters and carry copies of brochures in their offices; used materials to host a one-day workshop; conveyed materials regarding child labor to the Department of Orphans; posted the posters in orphanages; and set up an independent committee for the dispute resolution. 3. Kapisa: Distributed material to all departments of DoLSAMD; and disseminated the remainder to other government agencies in the province. <p><i>See Attachment III for the brochures and posters.</i></p> <p>The project also developed four television clips in close consultation with MoLSAMD. Each one of the clips focused on an important provision of the Afghan Labor Law: dispute resolution, working hours, pension, and safety equipment. The topics were finalized after a lengthy period of discussion with MoLSAMD. Due to their completion just prior to the project’s end, and the lack of project budget, the Foundation turned the completed clips over to MoLSAMD. As of this date, the Ministry has not yet broadcast the clips but has prioritized this for the future.</p> <p><i>See Attachment IV for text of the four television clips.</i></p>																												
<p>Activity 2.2: <i>Expand training on the new Labor Law and International Labor Standards for key representatives of workers, employers, judiciary, and civil society.</i></p>	<p>The Foundation conducted three provincial trainings in this activity, in Baghlan, Bamiyan, and Nangarhar for 570 participants (471 male and 99 female). Details on each of the training programs follows below:</p> <p>Baghlan Training Program:</p> <p>The Foundation organized a five-day training program in the city of Pulikhumri in the center of Baghlan from July 17-21, 2011 for 200 participants (142 male and 58 female) from various governmental and non-governmental organizations, including government officials, civil society members, judges, and members of trade unions. Participants included:</p> <table> <tr> <th>Stakeholder Organizations</th> <th>Male</th> <th>Female</th> <th>Total Participants</th> </tr> <tr> <td>Trade Unions</td> <td>69</td> <td>11</td> <td>80</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Civil Society</td> <td>20</td> <td>10</td> <td>30</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Employers (ACCI)</td> <td>10</td> <td>0</td> <td>10</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Judges</td> <td>8</td> <td>2</td> <td>10</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Government Officials</td> <td>35</td> <td>35</td> <td>70</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total</td> <td>142</td> <td>58</td> <td>200</td> </tr> </table>	Stakeholder Organizations	Male	Female	Total Participants	Trade Unions	69	11	80	Civil Society	20	10	30	Employers (ACCI)	10	0	10	Judges	8	2	10	Government Officials	35	35	70	Total	142	58	200
Stakeholder Organizations	Male	Female	Total Participants																										
Trade Unions	69	11	80																										
Civil Society	20	10	30																										
Employers (ACCI)	10	0	10																										
Judges	8	2	10																										
Government Officials	35	35	70																										
Total	142	58	200																										

	<p>Many high ranking officials attended the opening ceremony on July 17, 2011, including: representatives of the Governor’s Office; the director of DoLSAMD-Baghlan; director of the Department of Information and Culture (DoIC), the provincial office of Ministry of Information and Culture; director of Baghlan University; director of the Department of Hajj and Religious Affairs (DoHRA); and the mayor of Baghlan.</p> <p>In the five training classes, the master trainers discussed various labor related topics such as child labor, dispute resolution, forced labor, labor contracts, mediation and social dialogue, as well as the provisions in Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Standards.</p> <p>Despite the level of insecurity in Baghlan, the workshop had more participants than expected. Some directors of line departments in Baghlan participated in the training program, such as the director of DoHRA-Baghlan and the director of DoIC. In fact, after the first day of the training, news of the workshop’s effectiveness had spread to most parts of the city and the number of participants increased significantly. Although 170 participants were invited to the program, some 200 participated. There were others who sought to join, but the Foundation team had to restrict entry due to space and budget constraints.</p> <p>In the training evaluations, all participants expressed their satisfaction with the program and 98% requested repeat and follow-up workshops on a regular basis. The evaluations showed that participants viewed the program positively because it was related to their work and because they received information about their legal rights.</p> <p>Additionally, on the final day of training, Mr. Abdul Majid, the governor of Baghlan, visited the sessions. He observed one session for over 30 minutes and said, “I found this training program extremely interesting and important. I wish I had time and could participate in one of the sessions to take advantage of this myself.” The governor thanked the Foundation and the USDOL for organizing the training while also requesting the Foundation to conduct additional trainings of this type. According to DoLSAMD Director Mr. Ahmadi, it was the first time that the governor had visited a training held in Baghlan. Moreover, during the closing ceremony the director of DoHRA said, “I have attended many training programs, but none of them can be compared to this training. It was fantastic.”</p> <p>It should also be noted that the governor chaired the session on labor administration and all of Baghlan province’s line department directors participated. During this session, many directors requested the Baghlan-DoLSAMD Director Mr. Ahmadi to provide additional opportunities for other department staff to participate in future trainings. The high demand resulted in a request that the Foundation and MoLSAMD repeat the training program for the government staff who had been unable to attend this program. This was not possible under this agreement due to the budget and the other commitments under the approved work plan, but would be possible should there be future support for the continuation of these trainings.</p>
--	---

Bamiyan Training Program:

The Foundation conducted a five-day training from October 15-19, 2011 on Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Standards for Bamiyan government officials, trade unions, employers, judges, and civil society members (160 participants – 149 male and 11 female).

Departments that participated in the Bamiyan training included: Governor office, Provincial council, Department of Economic, Health, Education, Justice, Women Affairs, Rural Rehabilitation and Development, Haj and Religious, Agriculture, Refugees, Culture and Information, Urban Development, Border and Tribal, Telecommunication, Public Welfare, Mine and Industries, Environment, Red Cross and Red Crescent Society, Central Statistic, Transport, Water, Airport, Energy, and Finance, Central Bank, Bamiyan Court, Municipality, General Attorney Office, Afghanistan Independent Human Rights Commission, Afghanistan Chamber of Commerce and Industries, Afghanistan Independent Human Rights Commission, Action Aid, Youth High Council, and many other Civil Society organizations and associations. There were also participants from media and press offices and some UN agencies.

Detail of Bamiyan training participants:

Stakeholder Organizations	Male	Female	Number of Participants
Trade Unions	28	2	30
Civil Society	36	4	40
Employers (ACCI)	24	2	26
Judges	15	0	15
Government Officials	46	3	49
Total	149	11	160

The training program was inaugurated by the deputy governor of Bamiyan, Mr. Mohammad Asif Mobaligh. He said, “Most training programs conducted in the provinces are futile and unproductive, and are held just for the purpose of getting funds and to implement the activity. But it is a great pleasure that unlike other training programs, this training program is useful and effective in helping our officials in the Bamiyan better understand their responsibilities, obligations, rights and implement the provisions of the Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Standards.” He expressed gratitude to USDOL and the Foundation for conducting the training program.

The training covered many topics of Afghan Labor Law, with the training conducted with the training manual developed in Phase I. The topics included:

- Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Law provisions;
- Child Labor;
- Collective bargaining;
- Forced Labor;
- Labor Contract;

- Media and Dispute resolution;
- Mediation;
- Social Dialogue;
- Social Security; and
- Women and Labor Law.

The valediction ceremony, at the end of fifth day, was attended by the governor of Bamiyan, Ms. Habiba Sarabi. She spoke about the program and thanked MoLSAMD, USDOL, and the Foundation for conducting such an educational training for Bamiyan governmental and non-governmental personnel. She then strongly suggested MoLSAMD and the Foundation to hold a second training program for the senior staff of Bamiyan; governors of provinces; and heads of districts. At the end of the ceremony, Governor Habiba Sarab distributed certificates to the participants.

On behalf of the participants, Mr. Mohammad Ali Najafi, the director of Technical Services Department of Bamiyan said, “We found this training program different from other training programs because it was full of useful information and directly related to our daily work.” He went onto state: “Before participating in this training program, even in some arms of my own department, provisions of the Labor Law were being violated. I am sure it was the same for other departments too. Now that we have learned more about the Labor Law we will take immediate action to implement them in our workplace.”

In their evaluations of the training, the participants expressed satisfaction with the program and most of them requested additional training programs because this one was related to their jobs and important for every worker’s awareness. As both the opening and valediction ceremonies were considered very important events in Bamiyan, they were covered by Pajhowk Afghan News, Bamiyan National TV, Paiwand, Voice of America, and other local radio stations.

Nangarhar Training Program:

The Foundation launched its Nangarhar training on January 9, 2011. The five-day training program for 210 participants on the Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Standards was held in the center of Nangarhar province, Jalalabad city. In the opening ceremony, Nangarhar’s Deputy Governor Mohammad Alam Ishaqzai thanked the Foundation and USDOL for the program. The 6-hour training included 210 participants, 30 female and 180 male, as follows:

Stakeholder Organizations	Male	Female	Number of Participants
NUEA (Trade Unions)	72	12	84
Civil Society	35	7	42
ACCI (Employers)	19	2	21
Judges	21	0	21
Government Officials	33	9	42
Total	180	30	210

	<p>Participants from Afghan government included the following provincial departments of the respective line ministries: Economy, Education, Health, Information and Culture, Justice, Labor, Women Affairs, and the Civil Service Commission. Participants from civil society included the Afghan Civil Society Forum (ACSF), Civil Society and Human Rights Network (CSHRN), and the Independent Human Rights Commission (IHRC).</p> <p>The participants learned about various relevant issues such as child labor, labor contracts, forced labor, mediation, social dialogue, women and labor law, and social security as well as International Labor Standards.</p> <p>In the evaluation forms, participants appreciated the training program because it was relevant to their day-to-day work and gave them ideas about how to approach problems with their employers.</p> <p>Director of DoLSAMD-Nangarhar Mr. Mohammad Hashimd Ghamshareek said, “I can say that this has been the only useful training program in Nangarhar with such effectiveness.”</p> <p>As the word of the value of the training program had already reached the governor’s office, the deputy governor of Nangarhar announced that the governor would provide official appreciation letters to all members of the Foundation’s Labor Program as well as to the trainers. The governor sent an official letter to MoLSAMD and thanked the Foundation for its support.</p> <p>At the end of the program, the Foundation thanked the governor’s office and the stakeholder organizations for their cooperation. The Foundation expressed particular gratitude to the security and the police headquarters in Nangarhar as both had provided their officials and forces to ensure security during the training. Since the program was held for five consecutive days and had many governmental officials participating, security was a special concern. The support and presence of the security forces was thus crucial in the successful operation of the program.</p> <p>Media coverage of the event took place via national as well as local television stations. Nangarhar Television broadcast the opening and closing ceremonies of the program. Well-known newspapers of the province, such as <i>Nangarhar Daily Newspaper</i> published news of the program on the front page of their newspaper. The representative of the Civil Service Commission also prepared a complete report to upload on their organization website. Unfortunately, due to limited space on the server, the report is no longer available for view and a copy is not available.</p>
<p>Activity 2.3: Conduct trainings for the directors of administrative and HR departments of civil society</p>	<p>On March 13, 2011, the Foundation conducted a training on provisions of Afghan Labor Law for the directors of administrative and HR departments of civil society organizations and trade unions. There were 30 participants (8 women and 22 men). Participants included representatives from Afghan Development Association (ADA), Afghan Women’s Network (AWN), and Afghan NGO Coordination Bureau (ANCB), National Union of Afghanistan Employees (NUAE) as well as a number of international organizations.</p> <p>Topics covered in training included:</p>

<p>organizations and trade unions.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • General or Common Provisions of the Labor Law; • Health and Occupational Safety Conditions; • Payment of Salary; • Recruitment and Job Contracts; • Responsibilities of Employees; • Social Welfare and Security; • Standards and Rules of Work; • Vocational Training and Skills Development; • Work Discipline; and • Working Hours and Types of Leave. <p>In the participant evaluations, they expressed interested in the training program and sought similar but additional training programs in the future. Furthermore, they suggested the length of the training should be extended from one day to at least two days so participants could better able absorb the provisions of the Afghan Labor Law.</p>
<p>Activity 2.4: Hold training program on Afghan Labor Law provisions on women's rights in Balkh province.</p>	<p>The Foundation conducted a two-day training program in Balkh from June 29-30, 2011, for a total of 100 female workers. The program focused on the rights of women workers included in the Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Standards. The opening ceremony included a number of high-level officials: Mr. Razaqyar, director of Human Resources in the Governor's Office; director of DoLSAMD-Balkh; head of the trade unions, Balkh-NUEA; and members of the Provincial Council. Mr. Razaqyar from the Governor's Office spoke about the importance of the workshop and expressed his appreciation to USDOL and the Foundation for organizing the program.</p> <p>Master Trainer Bashir Ahmad Rasiq launched the training program with a slide show presentation. Provisions of Afghan Labor Law highlighted in the presentation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Compensation; • Contract labor; • Forced labor; • Leave; • Night shift; • Responsibilities of the organization towards workers; • Responsibilities of workers towards the organization; • Termination of contract; • Working hours; and • Other related issues. <p>During the two-day program, participants attentively listened to the lecture and shared their experiences with the class. Most of the participants shared instances in which the labor law had been violated in their places of employment, whether unintentionally and intentionally.</p> <p>Evaluation forms conveyed participants' impression that the program was well-</p>

	<p>conducted. The participants expressed a high level of satisfaction and indicated that participants found the training relevant to their work and reinforced the positive news that some labor law issues that had previously confused them had now been clarified. They requested more frequent labor law training programs in the near future.</p> <p>The training program was covered by two well-known TV channels, Balkh National TV and Arezo TV.</p>
--	---

Objective 3: Increased sustainability of the project impact.

Activity 3.1: Convene Labor Law Consultative Group.

The Foundation and MoLSAMD organized 11 Labor Law Consultative Groups (LLCG) in five provinces: Kabul, Baghlan, Balkh, Bamiyan, and Nangarhar. The schedule of meetings follows below:

Kabul	Balkh	Baghlan	Bamiyan	Nangarhar
2010 Dec 28	2011 July 7	2011 July 3	2011 Sept 12	2010 Dec 30
2011 Feb 9		2011 Nov 11		2011 April 16
2011 March 28				
2011 Aug 10				
2011 Oct 27				

KABUL LLCG MEETINGS

Kabul LLCG Meeting 1: December 28, 2010

The Foundation conducted the first LLCG meeting with representatives of stakeholder organizations in the MoLSAMD office in Kabul. Alongside MoLSAMD's departments of Labor Law and of Labor Inspection, participants included representatives from the Afghan Civil Society Forum, Civil Service Commission, Civil Society and Human Rights Network, Human Rights Commission, Ministry of Justice, and National Union of Afghanistan Employees (NUEA).

In this very first LLCG meeting, the following points were discussed:

- Overview of this Phase II US Department of Labor project;
- Upcoming Nangarhar province training program; and
- Impact of the training programs on labor in Kabul and other provinces.

The participants expressed appreciation for the support of USDOL and asked many questions about the second phase of the project. They also presented their ideas and suggestions regarding the upcoming Nangarhar training, which they considered very important.

Regarding the impact of the project on labor in the country, the representatives had positive comments. Three examples of the feedback on the labor law program

	<p>follow below:</p> <p><i>“Based on the feedback we received from our provincial offices, the training programs have been very effective and has created a lot of awareness. Some other provinces are also interested and need the same trainings. It is good that the Nangarhar training program will soon be organized.”</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mr. Nazari, Civil Society and Human Rights Network <p><i>“Based on the reports that our office has received from provinces, the trainings have been great.”</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mr. Ahmad Khan Raheen, National Union of Afghanistan <p><i>“Before these training programs, only the governmental organizations would refer to the Department of Labor Law for consultancy services about labor issues, but as a result of awareness activities, now we receive complaints from private organizations such as Roshan, MTN, private banks, etc., which is a clear example of the positive impact of the training programs.”</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mr. Karim Hameed, MoLSAMD Department of Labor Law
	<p>Kabul LLCG Meeting 2: February 9, 2011</p> <p>The new Deputy Minister of MoLSAMD, Seema Ghani, chaired the second Kabul LLCG meeting under Phase II of this program. The LLCG meeting included 16 participants from the following stakeholder organizations: Afghanistan Chamber of Commerce and Industries (ACCI); Afghanistan Independent Human Rights Commission (AIHRC); Civil Society and Human Rights Network (CSHRN); MoLSAMD departments of Labor Law and Labor Inspection; Ministry of Justice (Mojo); Ministry of Women’s Affairs (MoWA); and National Union of Afghanistan Employees (NUEA) representing trade unions.</p> <p>Deputy Minister Seema Ghani introduced herself to the LLCG members and trainers. She then spoke about some of the labor-related problems currently existing in the country and specifically in MoLSAMD. She also emphasized the need to improve coordination between stakeholder organizations.</p> <p>Following participant introductions, Mr. Javed Nawabi, the Foundation’s Labor Program Manager, described the training program hosted in Nangarhar from January 9 - 13, 2011. He presented information about the achievements and importance to the representatives of the organizations. He also confirmed receipt of the acknowledgment letter from the governor of Nangarhar. Participants in the meeting discussed the training on Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Standards hosted in Kabul and other targeted provinces with the deputy minister. Participants also expressed their concerns, ideas, and suggestions regarding Training of Trainers (ToT) program given to the ten master trainers as well as other program activities with the deputy minister.</p> <p>The participants indicated their full support and willingness to contribute to better support upcoming activities on behalf of their organizations.</p>

	<p>Kabul LLCG Meeting 3: March 28, 2011</p> <p>The Foundation organized the third LLCG meeting in MoLSAMD. Fourteen representatives from the following organizations participated: Afghan Civil Society Forum; Afghan Independent Human Rights Commission; Ministry of Justice; Ministry of Women’s Affairs; MoLSAMD departments of Labor Law and Labor Inspections; and National Union of Afghanistan Employees.</p> <p>The Foundation’s Labor Program Manager Javed Nawabi presented information about the ToT program and other upcoming activities to the participants. Questions raised for the LLCG attendees included why Afghan Labor Law provisions had not been properly implemented in government and non-governmental organizations, and the potential solutions to address the lack of implementation. Participants communicated their ideas, commented on the ToT program, and thanked the Foundation for conducting the program, which they felt was pivotal to their capacity being built. They said they had learned several significant techniques and methods of training during the ToT program. Moreover, the participants indicated they would provide their complete support for the preparation of recommendations for better implementation of Afghan Labor Law provisions and program activities.</p> <p>Kabul LLCG Meeting 4: August 10, 2011</p> <p>The Foundation organized the program’s fourth Kabul LLCG meeting. Representatives from the following organizations participated in the meeting: Afghanistan Chamber of Commerce and Industries (ACCI); Afghan Women Business Federation (AWBF); MoLSAMD’s departments of Labor Inspection, Labor, Working Conditions, External Relations, and Social Security; Ministry of Commerce and Industries; Ministry of Justice; and National Union of Afghanistan Employees (NUEA).</p> <p>Mr. Nawabi opened the meeting and presented information on the Afghan Labor Law and the revision process that is being organized by the ILO. He supplemented this information with news of upcoming Foundation-organized training programs on the Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Standards. He asked participants to highlight challenges they faced in their organizations so that future activities could be tailored to meet their needs.</p> <p>The participants thanked USDOL and the Foundation for conducting the LLCG meetings on a regular basis. They expressed their gratitude for the opportunity to gather all stakeholder organizations to constructively discuss Afghan Labor Law and problems encountered during its implementation. The members then expressed their opinions on potential Afghan Labor Law reforms, asserting that this process would take at least one or two years and that it would be difficult for ILO to complete the revision process of the Afghan Labor Law according to the current timeline. Participants also reflected upon the general low awareness of the Afghan Labor Law and suggested that the training programs be conducted periodically in Kabul and other provinces. The participants emphasized, “If the awareness programs are stopped, we will lose all the achievements that we have made during</p>
--	---

	<p>the past years.” The LLCG meeting concluded after a lengthy discussion on labor-related issues.</p>
	<p>Kabul LLCG Meeting 5: October 27, 2011</p> <p>The Foundation organized the fifth LLCG meeting in Kabul. Representatives from the following stakeholder organizations were present:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Afghan Chamber of Commerce and Industries; • Afghan Civil Society Form; • Afghan Women Business Federation; • Afghan Women Network; • Afghanistan Independent Human Rights Commission; • Human Rights and Civil Society Network; • Labor Inspections department of MoLSAMD; • Labor Law department of MoLSAMD; • Manpower department of MoLSAMD; • Working Conditions department of MoLSAMD • Ministry of Commerce and Industries; and • National Union of Afghanistan Employees. <p>Chaired by Foundation Labor Program Manager Javed Nawabi, he spoke about the current status of the program and presented information on the training program of Bamiyan. He thanked the master trainers for the successful implementation of the Bamiyan training program.</p> <p>On behalf of their organizations, each participant expressed their support and appreciation of the overall program. Mr. Abdul Karim Hamid, the previous director of Labor Law Department and current advisor to the deputy minister said, “In the last ten years, this program has been one of the most successful programs in MoLSAMD.” Mr. Shabrang, the head of NUEA said, “We seldom have projects which are really good for the country and people. Fortunately, this project was one of the most useful projects for this country.”</p> <p>At the end of the meeting, representatives of the stake holder organizations agreed that on behalf of their organizations, they would prepare requests and submit them to the MoLSAMD Minister for an extension of this project.</p>
	<p>NANGARHAR LLCG MEETINGS</p>
	<p>Nangarhar LLCG Meeting 1: December 30, 2010</p> <p>The Foundation organized the first LLCG meeting in Jalalabad, the center of Nangarhar province. The meeting, held in the DoLSAMD-Nangarhar office, included representatives from: Afghanistan Chamber of Commerce and Industries (ACCI); National Union of Afghanistan Employees (NUEA); Civil Society and Human Rights Network (CSHRN); Independent Administrative Reform Civil Service Commission; Independent Human Rights Commission; and various provincial departments in Nangarhar including Education, Information and Culture,</p>

	<p>DoLSAMD, Justice; and the Nangarhar Court.</p> <p>Participants expressed the need for this project due to the present situation in Nangarhar where there is low awareness and compliance with the Afghan Labor Law. They also discussed various labor-related issues and offered suggestions to improve the implementation of Afghan Labor Law.</p> <p>The Foundation staff discussed the upcoming training program in Nangarhar and provided guidance regarding the selection of the training program participants. The LLCG members committed to careful selection of participants for the training.</p> <p>As establishment of the LLCG and the conduct of the first meeting were considered important events in the province, news about the meeting was broadcast by the National Radio and TV Station of Nangarhar.</p> <p>Nangarhar LLCG Meeting 2: April 16, 2011</p> <p>The Foundation facilitated the second LLCG meeting in Nangarhar. The meeting was chaired by Abdul Hakim Shirzad, director of the DoLSAMD-Nangarhar. Representatives from the following departments and organizations participated: Afghan Civil Society Forum; Afghanistan Chamber of Commerce and Industries; Afghanistan Independent Human Rights Commission; Civil Society and Human Rights Network; DoLSAMD; departments of Information and Culture, and Justice; Nangarhar Court; and Nangarhar University</p> <p>The meeting opened with Mr. Shirzad thanking USDOL, the Foundation team, and the participants for their assistance and attendance. He then introduced himself to the LLCG members as the new director of DoLSAMD-Nangarhar. He told the audience he would try his best to pave the path for effective implementation of the Afghan Labor Law across governmental and non-governmental organizations in Nangarhar. He also expressed his commitment to conducting these LLCG meetings in the future to discuss various issues related to labor and to identify solutions to the concerns expressed.</p> <p>This was followed by a discussion of the status of labor law implementation as well as existing labor issues in Nangarhar. Participants discussed the weak implementation of Afghan Labor Law in the province and suggested a more active role of the Labor Inspection Department in the province. Furthermore they suggested the need for more support from MoLSAMD through evaluation of governmental and non-governmental organizations. They said the program was very useful and beneficial for the trainees as it conveyed to them essential information regarding their labor rights, obligations, and responsibilities under Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Standards. They also stated that this had been the first time such a large-scale training program had been conducted in Nangarhar for government officials, judges, workers, employers, and civil society members. They expressed their need and hope for more such training programs in the province.</p> <p>The participants requested that the director of DoLSAMD-Nangarhar organize LLCG meeting periodically in the future. One indication of the deep interest in the labor law in Nangarhar was that the meeting lasted longer than other LLCG</p>
--	--

	meetings as discussions were very lively.
	BAGHLAN LLCG MEETINGS
	<p>Baghlan LLCG Meeting 1: July 3, 2011</p> <p>The Foundation organized the first LLCG meeting in Pulikhumri, a city located in the center of Baghlan. The LLCG meeting was chaired by the director of DoLSAMD-Baghlan, Mohammad Mushtaq Ahmadi, and attended by a range of participants including representatives from: Department of Justice; Department of Women's Affairs; Human Rights Commission; Mostufiat, the Finance Office and Representative of the Ministry of Finance in the provinces; and National Union of Afghanistan Employees in Baghlan.</p> <p>DoLSAMD Director Mohammad Mushtaq Ahmadi welcomed the participants. As it was the first LLCG meeting in Baghlan, Mr. Nawabi, the Foundation's Labor Law Program Manager, spoke about the goals, objectives, and activities of the project, as well as the responsibilities of the LLCG members. He asked the participants to actively promote the implementation of Afghan Labor Law throughout the province. Mr. Nawabi presented information about the upcoming training program in Baghlan. The LLCG members committed to fully supporting the program and said the Foundation could expect complete cooperation from DoLSAMD. They also emphasized the importance of the program in the province as they described Baghlan's very low level of awareness regarding the country's labor law.</p> <p>The participants expressed their appreciation for the training and thanked the Foundation for the opportunity. They also committed to nominating the best employees in their organizations to participate in future LLCG meetings. The meeting concluded after a 90-minute discussion on labor issues.</p>
	<p>Baghlan LLCG Meeting 2: November 11, 2011</p> <p>The second LLCG meeting was held, also in Pulikhumri, and chaired by the director of DoLSAMD-Baghlan. Participants represented various stakeholder organizations, such as: Department of Intelligence; Department of Justice; Department of Women's Affairs; Human Rights Commission; Office of Attorney General; and trade unions.</p> <p>In the meeting, the participants discussed the impact of the Afghan Labor Law awareness program in Baghlan and recommended that the awareness program be provided for all directors in all governmental and non-governmental organizations. They said the program was very useful as employees in most organizations were gaining awareness regarding the Afghan Labor Law.</p> <p>The head of Attorney General Office said that it was a great opportunity for the employees of various participating organizations to gain awareness about Afghan Labor Law as they were now are defending their rights. He also said it was not a governmental issue alone, as the Afghan Labor Law also goes unimplemented in the private sector. Furthermore, with workers engaged in the private sector, employers disobeying the labor law provisions had an impact on society. He</p>

	<p>recommended the Inspection Department of MoLSAMD take serious actions to prevent violations of Afghan Labor Law.</p> <p>The director of the Department of Justice of Baghlan said, “Twenty-three of our employees claimed their rights right after this workshop. This itself is a clear indication of how effective this program is.”</p> <p>After discussing the training program in Baghlan, the participants expressed concerns regarding certain provisions of Afghan Labor Law as it differed from the Civil Service Labor Law. A lack of understanding was also expressed as in the past trade unions would not award or sentence anyone without an agreement, but such a provision had been removed from the Afghan Labor Law.</p> <p>In addition to the concerns expressed, suggestions were also made:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Inspection Department ought to take action against violators of the Afghan Labor Law; • The Labor Law awareness program should be organized for directors of all organizations in Baghlan; and • Talks must be held with the senior management of private sector organizations so that they too obey the Afghan Labor Law. <p>The meeting continued for two hours. The recommendations and suggestions were presented to MoLSAMD for its review.</p>
	<p style="text-align: center;">BALKH LLCG MEETING</p>
	<p>Balkh LLCG Meeting 1: July 7, 2011</p> <p>The Foundation organized the Balkh LLCG meeting which was chaired by the director of DoLSAMD. Participants included representatives from the following: Afghan Chamber of Commerce and Industries of Balkh; Balkh High Court; Civil Service Commission; Civil Society and Human Rights Network; Department of Justice; Independent Human Rights Commission; and National Union of Employees of Afghanistan (NUEA)-Balkh.</p> <p>Representatives discussed existing problems and challenges encountered when implementing the Afghan Labor Law in Balkh. The head of NUEA-Balkh, Mr. Haqmullah Qurbani, talked about the low level of labor law awareness in Balkh and requested additional training programs. Representing civil society, Ms. Nasima Naskia, recommended the Inspection Department take a more proactive role in promoting adherence to the Afghan Labor Law by conducting frequent visits to employers in Balkh. LLCG members also requested the Foundation to use public service announcements on television and radio channels to increase awareness of relevant provisions in the Afghan Labor Law.</p> <p>The director of DoLSAMD requested participants commit to respecting Afghan Labor Law within their own organizations. In response, the Balkh LLCG participants promised they would make concerted efforts to implement the Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Standards in their organizations.</p>

	<p style="text-align: center;">BAMIYAN LLCG MEETING</p> <p>Bamiyan LLCG 1: September 12, 2011</p> <p>The Foundation organized the first LLCG meeting in Bamiyan, which was chaired by Mr. Sayed Raza Qasimi, director of DoLSAMD-Bamiyan. Representatives from the following departments and organizations participated in the meeting: Afghanistan Independent Human Rights Commission; Attorney General’s Office; Bamiyan civil society organizations and trade unions; Bamiyan Court; DoLSAMD; and departments of Economics, Finance, Justice, and Women’s Affairs.</p> <p>Mr. Qasimi welcomed the participants, thanked them for their attendance, and expressed his gratitude to the Foundation for facilitating the meeting and to USDOL for supporting the program. Next, the Foundation presented information about the Foundation’s Labor Law Program’s activities and training programs with regards to Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Standards. The Foundation team then described tasks and responsibilities of LLCG members and requested them to actively support the implementation of the Afghan Labor Law in Bamiyan.</p> <p>Participants of the LLCG meeting discussed reasons for the weak implementation of Labor Law in Bamiyan. Throughout the discussions, heavy emphasis was placed on the need to promote awareness raising programs. Participants explained that information about their rights, responsibilities, and obligations in accordance to the Afghan Labor Law could reduce tensions between employees and employers. The issue of participation in the training program was also raised during the meeting and it was suggested that in addition to government officials, judges, workers, employers, and civil society members, informal workers from the unorganized sector should also have been invited to the training. Participants explained that informal workers are often even more unaware of labor issues and their rights, and are therefore more vulnerable to exploitation. The Foundation agreed to invite representatives of informal workers, miners in the case of Bamiyan, as many in the informal sector are in the mines to trainings. In the next training there was representation of such an individual from the informal sector. At the end of the meeting, all participants indicated their organizations’ support to act according to Afghan Labor Law.</p> <p>Bamiyan Deputy Governor Mr. Mohammad Asif Mobaligh expressed his appreciation to USDOL and the Foundation for their endeavors, and confirmed that the governor’s office would fully support their activities in Bamiyan. Mr. Mobaligh also requested that DoLSAMD-Bamiyan Director Mr. Qasimi facilitate the LLCG meeting and support the Foundation in making arrangements for the five-day training program.</p> <p>Prior to the LLCG meeting in Bamiyan, the Foundation met Deputy Governor of Bamiyan, Mr. Mobaligh. The meeting was arranged in order to discuss the establishment of the LLCG and the upcoming five-day training program on Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Standards in Bamiyan.</p>
<p>Activity 3.2: Facilitate</p>	<p>The Foundation conducted a three-day training of trainers (ToT) on techniques of training for the 10 new master trainers. In the training, held from June 19-21, 2011</p>

	5	Laila Arabshahi	Female	AWBF																														
	6	Nazar Mohammad Khazan	Male	MoLSAMD																														
	7	Noorul Rhaman Nazari	Male	MoLSAMD																														
	8	Roqia Gowhary	Female	MoC																														
	9	Safiullah Asfia	Male	MoLSAMD																														
	10	Shahsawar Satari	Male	MoLSAMD																														
	11	Shereen Sha Seerat	Male	MoLSAMD																														
	12	Wida Latif	Female	AWN																														
	13	Zikullah Hafizi	Male	MoLSAMD																														
<p>The evaluation forms showed that the trainees were greatly satisfied with the ToT program and particularly appreciated the teaching methods, training materials, and administrative services the training availed to them. Furthermore, they requested more such constructive training programs be provided in the future.</p>																																		
Activity 3.3: Support MoLSAMD in establishment of employment center.	<p>As per the revised project documents under the direction of USDOL with the US Embassy in Kabul in April 2011, the Foundation supported the establishment of the MoLSAMD’s Kabul Employment Service Center (KESC) by providing IT equipment and furniture. These additions were designed to increase the Center’s productivity through the availability of more adequate facilities to provide service to unemployed Afghans. MoLSAMD wanted to establish the Kabul Employment Center as a model, with replication in other provinces after a demonstration of the positive impact of the one in Kabul.</p> <p>Following the request of MoLSAMD’s Deputy Minister Seema Ghani and an assessment conducted by the Foundation of the needs, the selection of IT equipment and furniture was finalized in accordance with the Center’s needs and the project budget.</p> <p>These items were purchased for the Kabul Employment Service Center:</p> <p>Furniture</p> <table> <tr> <th>No</th> <th>Description</th> <th>QTY</th> </tr> <tr> <td>1</td> <td>Desk (180 cm x 75 cm) with 3 drawers on each side</td> <td>1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2</td> <td>High quality desk chair</td> <td>1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3</td> <td>Low bookcase with 2 shelves</td> <td>3</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4</td> <td>Coat Rack</td> <td>4</td> </tr> <tr> <td>5</td> <td>Sofa with two matching chairs</td> <td>2</td> </tr> <tr> <td>6</td> <td>Desk (160 cm x 75 cm) with 3 drawers on each side</td> <td>12</td> </tr> <tr> <td>7</td> <td>Managerial desk chair</td> <td>2</td> </tr> <tr> <td>8</td> <td>Staff desk chair</td> <td>10</td> </tr> <tr> <td>9</td> <td>Oval meeting table (250 cm long x 100 cm wide) with 12 chairs</td> <td>1</td> </tr> </table>				No	Description	QTY	1	Desk (180 cm x 75 cm) with 3 drawers on each side	1	2	High quality desk chair	1	3	Low bookcase with 2 shelves	3	4	Coat Rack	4	5	Sofa with two matching chairs	2	6	Desk (160 cm x 75 cm) with 3 drawers on each side	12	7	Managerial desk chair	2	8	Staff desk chair	10	9	Oval meeting table (250 cm long x 100 cm wide) with 12 chairs	1
	No	Description	QTY																															
	1	Desk (180 cm x 75 cm) with 3 drawers on each side	1																															
2	High quality desk chair	1																																
3	Low bookcase with 2 shelves	3																																
4	Coat Rack	4																																
5	Sofa with two matching chairs	2																																
6	Desk (160 cm x 75 cm) with 3 drawers on each side	12																																
7	Managerial desk chair	2																																
8	Staff desk chair	10																																
9	Oval meeting table (250 cm long x 100 cm wide) with 12 chairs	1																																

IT Equipment

No	Description	Model	QT Y	Serial numbers
1	Server Dell Power Edge (PE R710 1 X Xeon E5520 (2.26GHz, 8MB, 5.86 GT/s QPI, Turbo, HT)	R710	1	JP67T4J
2	HP LaserJet Printer (Black and White)	1102	1	VNC3905106
3	HP LaserJet Printer (Color)	2025	1	CNCJ739423
4	HP Scan-jet Scanner	G2410	1	CNOCGT208D-L2694A-301
5	500GB USB External hard drive (pocket size)	ADATA Classic	2	GS001200462207 & GS001200462207
6	Santak Line-Interactive 1000VA UPS	Santak	7	110408-87630103 / 110408- 87630189 / 110409- 87630047 / 110303- 8763155 / 110409-87630103 / 110304-87630031 / 110409-87630263
7	Sony-Multimedia Projector	EX100	1	5064287
8	Projector Screen with Stand	Sony	1	NA
9	Kaspersky Anti Virus	NA	7	NA
10	Dell Optiplex Desktop	990 MT	7	9PYZBQ1 / 9RLZCQ1 / 9PP5CQ1 / 9RDOCQ1 / 9RKOCQ1 / 9RNKCQ1 / 9PVYBQ1
11	Network Cables	Cath5e	1	NA

The project further developed 10,000 brochures for the KESC, describing its purpose and what services are available for employers as well as job-seeking potential employees. The brochures were developed in three languages: Dari, Pashtu, and English. To date, 2,000 have been distributed.

Approximately 20 visitors a day arrive at the Kabul Employment Service Center to receive assistance in finding jobs. Of the total 700 visitors to date, 80% are male and 20% are female. Using the KESC, 205 of the visitors have prepared and finalized their resumes while over 105 individuals have found jobs due to the introductions to job posting sites such as ACBAR as

	<p>well as other offices. Most of the visitors learned about the Center through the brochures and the visiting cards that had been developed for Center staff by the Foundation. Till date a total of 2,000 brochures on KESC have been distributed.</p> <p><i>See Attachment V for the employment service center brochure.</i></p>
--	---

<p>DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVE (Goal)</p>	<p>To contribute to the protection and promotion of labor rights in Afghanistan by strengthening the ability of MoLSAMD to enforce the Afghan labor law and by increasing understanding and awareness of the law and of international core labor standards among workers, employers, other government organizations, members of the judiciary, and civil society.</p>
--	---

Narrative assessment of the contribution of the project/program to development objective:

Strengthening the ability of MoLSAMD to enforce the Afghan labor law: The project contributed to greater knowledge of the labor law through trainings, LLCG meetings, development of outreach materials, and wider availability of the Training Manual. By decision of the Ministry, the focus was on two departments, Labor Law and Inspection. The heads of provincial departments participated in varying degrees, with the highest repeated participation in the targeted provinces of Kabul, Baghlan, Balkh, Bamiyan, and Nangarhar. Likewise in these locations, the participation of the heads of other line departments raised their awareness of the labor law and international standards. This is very positive and the project was most successful in terms of targeted departments in MoLSAMD and the targeted provinces. However, due to the limited duration and scope as compared to the total number of departments and staff across Afghanistan, much remains to be done to ensure a minimum level of knowledge with MoLSAMD's many departments and huge number of staff at national and provincial levels.

The result was similar for other government institutions with vital interests in labor issues (e.g., Justice, Women's Affairs). The workshops and LLCGs, where many may have met for the first time, provided exposure to their shared interests and roles in ensuring stronger enforcement and awareness of the labor law. It also raised awareness of all that remains to be done, across target groups and sectoral interests, and to repeated requests for more training opportunities.

Increasing understanding and awareness of the law and of international core labor standards among workers, employers, other government organizations, members of the judiciary, and civil society: The Foundation successfully fulfilled this objective as the three primary institutions, employees, employers, and government were invited and trained on the Labor Law and International Labor Standards. In training MoLSAMD staff as well as orienting representatives of related ministries and departments, the government was reached. Moreover, in training representatives of trade unions and employers (chiefly through the National Union of Afghanistan Employees (NUEA) and Afghanistan Chamber of Commerce and Industries (ACCI), the Foundation built their capacity to better reach both employees and employers. Accompanied by the many outreach materials (brochures, posters, television clips), they have ongoing opportunities to highlight labor issues important to their constituencies.

This program helped to create stronger linkages between government and other institutions/groups crucial to stronger enforcement of the Afghan Labor Law. A positive impact is that the program provided concrete opportunities for the interaction of these groups with each other. The program has specifically resulted in outcomes that will continue to contribute to intended achievements: not only have MoLSAMD, NUEA, and ACCI expressed appreciation and commitment to ensuring compliance with the Afghan Labor Law, but the LLCGs in the target provinces provide opportunities for the inter-linking web of governmental and non-governmental organizations to further improve the ability to protect and promote labor rights in Afghanistan.

As a result of the program, many offices experienced an increase in the number of filed complaints and reported violations. This is a significant achievement but also raises the important challenge of ensuring that institutions are able to respond to the complaints in an efficient and effective manner.

Immediate Objectives

Immediate Objective 1

Increased understanding and awareness of the new Afghan Labor Law and internationally recognized core labor standards known as the International Labor Standards within MoLSAMD and other ministries.

Immediate Objective 2

Increased understanding and awareness of the new Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Standards amongst workers, employers, their respective representatives, judges, members of the judiciary, and civil society.

Immediate Objective 3

Increased sustainability of the project impact.

IV. PROBLEMS / ISSUES MATERIALLY IMPAIRING THE ACHIEVEMENT OF PROJECT OBJECTIVES, PROPOSED SOLUTIONS AND ACTIONS TAKEN OR TO BE TAKEN

A. Implementation: (include technical as well as management issues; including administrative, financial and budgetary issues)

Problem/Issues	Proposed solutions and action(s) taken or to be taken (if action necessary, identify person responsible)
Communication: After discussion with DOL and MoLSAMD, the Foundation revised its workplan to remove one of its activities (establishing a High Council at MoLSAMD), since MoLSAMD had already agreed to a 3-year effort on the same topic under its ILO agreement. (Activity 1.3)	Although there was steady communication with MoLSAMD, in the future the Foundation will seek to reinforce the project work plan, so that its obligations under the agreement will be clearer and help to prevent overlapping of efforts.
Planning: While the Foundation produced four television clips regarding different provisions of Afghan Labor Law, broadcasting them on television had not been budgeted. As such, the clips were handed over to MoLSAMD for them to coordinate their airing. (Activity 2.1)	The television clips were developed and approved only at the end of the project. If they had been finalized sooner, it would have been possible to consider budget re-alignment with the approval of the USDOL.

<p>High Demand: The Foundation had to accommodate more participants than planned, as word spread about the trainings, and on some occasions, restrict the participation of some interested in the opportunity due to space and budget limitations. (Activity 2.2)</p>	<p>In the future, in order to better accommodate the increased interest and commitment to promoting labor laws, the Foundation could develop follow-on activities so that the training has a ripple effect in offices and organizations not directly involved in the trainings.</p>
<p>Depth: The Afghan Labor Law is comprised of 14 chapters and 42 regulations. While most trainings lasted five days, one of them was scheduled for one-day. This limited duration training program is very intense and likely too packed - especially for those participants who are not familiar with the labor law - to comfortably gain understanding. (Activity 2.3)</p>	<p>In the future, trainings for those unfamiliar with the labor law should be appropriately lengthened in order to more effectively cover the training material.</p>

B. Stakeholders, partners and implementing agencies:

Problem/Issues	Proposed solutions and action(s) taken or to be taken (if action necessary, identify person responsible)
<p>MoLSAMD Approvals: The Foundation worked very closely with the MoLSAMD in the implementation of this project. The need for Ministry approval of training dates, brochures, etc., sometimes led to long delays in being able to implement some approved activities.</p>	<p>Earlier consultation on all activities would help to limit the impact on the overall program (for instance, even if brochures are scheduled for Quarter Four, start discussions in Quarter One or Two).</p>
<p>Female Participation: The Foundation made strong efforts to strengthen gender balance throughout the program, including in its trainings. More active participation of women was constrained chiefly by the limited numbers of women working in the targeted departments and offices under this program.</p>	<p>When inviting participants to the trainings, the Foundation encouraged female participants, and during the trainings, the importance of gender equality was emphasized.</p>

C. External factors:

Problem/Issues	Proposed solutions and action(s) taken or
----------------	---

	to be taken (if action necessary, identify person responsible)
Security: Due to lack of security across the country, participants were sometimes unable to travel to attend programs and the Foundation was unable to organize them at the times/places in the workplan. The security delays impacted the timely implementation of the workplan as the limited duration did not allow much time flexibility.	As the Foundation cannot determine or influence security, in any future programs, security should be taken into stronger consideration in establishing the timetable. Alternatively, the design of future programs should focus more strongly on implementation by local stakeholders, without the involvement of Kabul-based individuals.
High turn-over rate of LLCG members: During the LLCG meetings it was noted that due to the nature of government posting, members of LLCG who joined in their capacity as a certain official would move and there was a delay in arrival of the new official to fill post.	As this turnover is an external factor over which the Foundation has little control, any future programs could identify more general representation from the targeted institutions, rather than a specific position in the particular department.

D. Other major issues/problems

Problem/Issues	Proposed solutions and action(s) taken or to be taken (if action necessary, identify person responsible)
The Foundation recognized the authority of the USDOL which had issued the agreement. However, the role and authority of the US Embassy's Deputy Economic Counselor in Kabul was not clear; this impacted the progress of the project because of the mid-stream comments on the workplan (which led to changes in April 2011 and to the request for a no-cost extension).*	At the outset of any future program, it is crucial for the USDOL to confirm the various roles of entities outside Washington, so that there is less confusion about the guidance received from the non-Washington based entities.

*In the middle of the project, the Foundation received comments on the work plan and scheduled activities from USDOL through the deputy economic counselor of the US Embassy in Kabul. After discussion and guidance from USDOL, the Foundation met with the new deputy minister before jointly meeting with the new deputy minister and the deputy economic counselor to discuss the proposed activities.

In the April 14, 2011 tripartite meeting, all parties present agreed to have the Foundation re-focus in specific areas. These newly identified areas included:

1. Establishing a model employment center in Kabul;
2. Developing brochures regarding safe migration;
3. Establishing a High Council in MoLSAMD;
4. Providing extensive training for provincial MoLSAMD staff;
5. Providing labor materials to the provinces; and
6. Providing a labor lawyer to MoLSAMD to help develop regulations for the Afghan Labor Law.

These points were referred to USDOL in Washington, D.C. and following the approval and revision of the project documents and budget, the project resumed its activities.

V. OPPORTUNITIES

In working towards promoting and protecting the rights of workers in Afghanistan with the MoLSAMD over the 15-month project period, three potential new initiatives and interventions became evident. They include: further increasing awareness of Afghan Labor Law responding both to need and the high degree of interest expressed; emphasizing monitoring of the Afghan Labor Law; and expanding the sectors targeted.

Evaluation forms from the trainings and programs demonstrated unexpectedly high interest in learning more about and protecting labor rights. For instance, Ms. Habiba Sarabi, governor of Bamiyan suggested the Foundation and MoLSAMD provide such training to not only all provincial governors but also heads of districts. Alongside seeking more training, a longer span of each training was also considered worthwhile.

While the extension of a project like this would be timely and respond to expressed needs, it would also be costly. Therefore, consideration of alternative approaches is advised. This would primarily be a concentration on training of trainers, accompanied by a small pool of funds dedicated to the training participants being able to organize follow-on trainings in their home communities or organizations. The cadre of Master Trainers would be used in these follow-on trainings. A second means of attuning more workers to their labor rights would be to further invest in increased number of public service announcements. Alongside the four television clips developed under this program, sound bites for radio, brochures and posters more in-depth booklets describing Afghan Labor Law, could be distributed more widely.

In addition to increasing the reach of this program, another aspect could focus on monitoring the governmental departments, organizational offices, and private employers to ensure that Afghan Labor Laws are not being violated. While increasing awareness of more and more Afghan is necessary, it would prove futile should appropriate and safe means of filing complaints be difficult or are not sufficiently available. Furthermore, repercussions for those that knowingly and repeatedly violate the Afghan Labor Law could also spread word of such labor laws as much as encourage more employers to abide by the provisions. Emphasizing monitoring alongside awareness could ensure maximum impact of the objectives of this project.

It is crucial that the increased knowledge of the labor law does not create more frustration. Just as Ms. Nasima Naskia, representing civil society, advised the Foundation recommend the Inspection Department increase frequency of site visits to ensure Afghan Labor Law is being observed and enforced, workers could also be shown how best to file complaints and violations of Afghan Labor Law at their workplace. While increasing the awareness of both employers and employees has been the goal of this project, broader progress requires that Afghanistan should have a more adequate ability to respond to complaints in a timely and effective manner.

The Foundation targeted multiple sectors to fulfill its objectives: government (MoLSAMD as the primary institution, with its departments, and other ministries); private employers through its professional association and the Afghan Chamber of Commerce and Industries (ACCI); workers, through the National Union of Afghan Employees (NUAE); and other groups such as the Afghan Independent Human Rights Commission, concerned with rights or labor rights more specifically. The greater concentration was on workers involved in the formal sector. In such a focus, the program missed the opportunity to engage with a vulnerable community, the informal sector. While more unorganized, future programs should consider efforts to reach this vulnerable community.

Looking to the future, it is crucial that university curricula should include the topic of Afghan Labor Law and International Labor Standards. Initiatives to ensure that relevant law, public administration, or business administration university faculty are aware of and are utilizing the contents of the Training Curriculum in their courses would help to ensure that Afghanistan's younger generation is aware of the labor law and international standards but more importantly, will contribute to a broader and deeper understanding of the country's legal framework and the needs of its citizens in the labor market.

VI. LESSONS LEARNED AND EMERGING GOOD PRACTICES

A number of major lessons learned and good practices emerged from the implementation of this project. Several of them are also reflected in the final evaluation attached to this Final Report.

The good practices:

- 1) Training Manual: the training manual, developed in the first phase of this program, was an essential tool for the trainings conducted under Phase II. More importantly, the training curriculum also became an invaluable reference guide for all of the participants in their daily work.
- 2) Master Trainers: the development of a cadre of Master Trainers, drawn from various stakeholder organizations, was crucial in ensuring sustainability after the conclusion of the program. The knowledge and skills imparted during their training on the Afghan Labor Law and core International Labor Standards, as well as the training on "techniques of training" contributed to these individuals' professional development. In a number of cases, the Master Trainers were promoted to more senior positions in their respective organizations; this therefore increased the credibility and legitimacy of the USDOL-

supported program and of the government's efforts to strengthen implementation and enforcement of the labor law.

- 3) IEC Materials: the posters and brochures were useful public awareness tools for the program participants, particularly in raising awareness of a predominately illiterate population. Their effectiveness was increased when the training attendees, etc., used them to complement or reinforce their ongoing efforts rather than as stand-alone posters in offices.

The lessons learned:

Master Trainers: the impact of the Master Trainer approach was positive, as described above under the “good practices” section. However, it is also clear that greater effectiveness could have been achieved by expanding the number and geographic representation of the Master Trainers and by delinking their status as Master Trainers from their organizational positions. This would have moderated the impact of the loss of some trainers as experienced during both Phase I and Phase II. For example, the Master Trainer from the Human Rights and Civil Society Network left the country to study overseas and the one from the Labor Law Department of MoLSAMD resigned from her position for reasons unrelated to this project. Additionally, in any future effort, at the time of selection of trainers, the level of future time commitment for trainings should be clear so that appropriate decisions can be made. This issue became clear when some Master Trainers' professional responsibilities precluded their participation – this primarily hampered two representatives of the Supreme Court whose line functions did not permit them to carry out any labor law trainings.

LLCG Members: the establishment of LLCGs at the national and provincial levels assisted the MoLSAMD and DoLSAMDs to maintain their links with other line ministries as well as non-governmental stakeholders with vital interest in labor. In particular, the turnover rate of LLCG members was a challenge due to the duration of assignments of government officials. LLCG members attend the LLCG meetings in their official capacities but each meeting had new LLCG members in attendance. When new members attended the LLCG meeting, they tended to be uninformed about the purpose and functions of the LLCG meetings due to the lack of overlap of assignment in the government offices. While the Foundation made every effort to update the new members, it clearly is not a viable situation. This therefore hampered the effectiveness of the meetings in terms of enabling all the stakeholders to contribute more strongly to the implementation of Afghan Labor Law. Another lesson learned is that any future project should include a minimum number of LLCG meetings in any one location – in this instance, while Kabul held five LLCG meetings, all of the provinces held only one or two LLCG meetings; even with the strongest commitment among the members, they did not have time to coalesce as a group. There are two changes that have the most potential to increase the effectiveness of the MoLSAMD's and DoLSAMD's convening of LLCG meetings. The first is the roll-out of the anticipated reform process in government staffing, after which there is expected to be a regular transition process with a formal turnover of responsibilities. Recognizing that government officials have busy schedules, the second change that will negate the impact of turnover or low turnout of participants is negotiation with the MoLSAMD, other government stakeholders, and non-governmental stakeholders to agree to identify alternative participants and members who

can attend when the designated representative is unable to do so. Together, these changes will help to ensure that LLCs will become more effective in the future.

Geographic breadth and depth: the evaluation of Phase II rightly points out that the program, while generally effective in reaching the project goals and objectives, reached a very small number of government officials, non-governmental stakeholders, and citizens in the labor market. The integrated nature of the Phase II program – inclusive of working with MoLSAMD, target DoLSAMDs, other governmental institutions, and non-governmental stakeholders – was primarily limited by available budget and time for this particular program design. Particularly given the high demand for information about the labor law, any future program design should concentrate on activities built for cascading impact and multiplier effect. For instance, more emphasis on the training of trainers and less on direct trainings in various locations, and additionally, support for more follow-on activities by participants within their own organizations or communities. Programs could also ensure that members of District Councils and Provincial Councils are aware of the Afghan Labor Law – of key interest to their constituents – since they have more direct contact with citizens and organizations in their locales. In addition, more strategic use of the public service announcements and IEC materials in various locales will help to complement the activities requiring more direct interaction with Afghan citizens in their various capacities. For instance, it would be useful to have the public service announcements at community centers and libraries, as well as government offices.

VIII. BUDGET LINE ITEM REVISIONS IN EXCESS OF USD 10,000

Due to the changes in the scope of work, as agreed at the tri-partite meeting of the MoLSAMD, Deputy Economic Counselor of the US Embassy/Kabul, and the Foundation, and as approved by the USDOL, the budget line items for consultant travel and fees were reduced.

IX. RESPONSE TO DONOR COMMENTS FROM LAST REPORT

The Foundation received no comments on the final quarterly report.

X. PROJECT DOCUMENTS

Annex 1: Workplan

Annex 2: PMP

Annex 2a: PMP with Narrative Assessment of each Indicator

Annex 3: Final Evaluation

Annex 3a: Final Evaluation Terms of Reference

Annex 4: Labor Law Project Photographs

Annex 5: Subcontracts

Annex 6: Training and Workshop Participants-Summary

Attachments

Attachment I: Training Manual

Attachment II: Migrant Workers: Brochure

Attachment III: Labor Law Posters and Brochures

Attachment IV: Television Clips (text of four clips)
Attachment V: Employment Service Center: Brochure